Pakistan Journal of Society, Education and Language (PJSEL)
Journal Homepage: https://pjsel.jehanf.com/index.php/journal ISSN
2521-8123 (Print)
2523-1227 (Online)

A Study of Code-switching Strategies in Pakistani Anglophone Writings

Naeem Khan Jadoon*[1], Dr. Mustanir Ahmad[2], Marriyam Qureshi[3]

Original Article

1. Assistant Professor, Department of Higher Education, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan.
Email: naeemkhanjadoon@gmail.com

2. Associate Professor and Chairman department of English, Hazara, University, Mansehra Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan. Email: mustanir@hu.edu.pk

3 .PhD Scholar, Doctoral School of Humanities, University of Warsaw, Poland.
Email: m.qureshi@uw.edu.pl

Keywords

Code-Switching; Pakistani Anglophone Writings; Pakistani English; Pakistani languages; Pakistani writers

Abstract

This study examined the different code-switching strategies used in the works of Pakistani Anglophone writers. Using a three-step process that comprises text selection, text coding and classification, and text analysis and interpretation, the researchers used the textual analysis approach. The research found that the use of code-switching in Pakistani Anglophone writingss ranged from the extreme fusion to the very modest, clear, and glossed use of Pakistani languages. Examples from the works—Kartography (2001) by Kamila Shamsie, Maps for Lost Lovers (2004) by Nadeem Aslam, The Diary of a Social Butterfly (2008) by Moni Mohsin, and In Other Rooms, Other Wonders (2009) by Daniyal Mueenuddin—support the assertion. The study found that Pakistani Anglophone writers extensively used code-switching strategies, which, on the one hand, filled in the lexical gaps in Standard English and, on the other, intentionally strived to create a Pakistani idiom in English.

1. Introduction

This study examined the use of various code-switching strategies in Pakistani Anglophone writingss. Since Pakistani Anglophone writingss are a byproduct of colonialism before independence. Therefore, an important aspect of these writingss entail the use of the English language in a discourse that reflects Pakistani sociocultural realities. In doing so, the Pakistani Anglophone writers 'refashioned' the language in order to have it acclimate to their sociocultural context. So that it can express ideas that its standard form would be unable to adequately communicate. As "we have fostered the language for over a century and we are entitled to bring it in line with our own habits and idiom" (Narayan, 1988, p.196), thus:

> We, the ex-colonised, have just subjugated the language, beaten it on its head, and made it ours! Let the English chafe, and fret, and fume. The fact remains that in adapting English to our use, in hammering it sometimes on its head, and in sometimes twisting its tail, we have given it a new shape, substance, and dimension (Sidhwa, 1993, p. 212).

In this process of acclimatization to English, Pakistani Anglophone writers used a number of strategies, code-switching being one of them. Code-switching is the process of alternating between two or more language codes within a single discourse, or "the juxtaposition within the same speech exchange of passages of speech belonging to two different grammatical systems or subsystems" (Gumperz, 1982, p. 59). In other words, it is the "alternate use of two or more languages in the same utterance or conversation" (Grosjean, 1982, p. 145). Since the "syncretic and hybridised nature of postcolonial experience refutes the privileged position of a standard code in the language and any mono-centric view of human experience" (Ashcroft, Griffiths, & Tiffin, 2001, p. 40), code-switching becomes a common occurrence. Moreover, Pakistan is a multilingual and multiethnic nation, and English, together with Urdu, serves as a link language—albeit an aristocratic one—between those who speak different languages within the country, English has thus become a Pakistani language. As Baumgardner, Kennedy, and Shamim (1993) argue about the identity of Pakistani English:

> Urduised words in Pakistani English give it a linguistic and cultural identity and it is more evident in the large number of loan words from Urdu and the other regional languages which have made their way more common in Pakistani English. The influence of Urduization seems all pervasive in Pakistani English (p. 42).

Therefore, code-switching—the alternative use of two or more languages for communication—is a common phenomenon in Pakistani Anglophone writingss. Since then, code-switching has allowed Pakistani Anglophone writers to refashion English and liberate it from the supposedly strict British variant in order to reflect Pakistani socio-cultural realities. Therefore, this study concentrates on the use of code-switching strategies in Pakistani Anglophone literature; specifically, the researchers analyzed the Pakistani Anglophone works produced between 2001 and 2009. The code-switching strategies in the works under study ranged from the extreme fusion in Pakistani Anglophone writingss to the very modest, transparent, and glossed use of Pakistani languages. The analysis is based on examples from the works of Kamila Shamsie's, *Kartography* (2001), Nadeem Aslam's, *Maps for Lost Lovers* (2004), Moni Mohsin's, *The Diary of a Social Butterfly* (2008), and Daniyal Mueenuddin's, *In Other Rooms, Other Wonders* (2009). These works consist of two novels, one collection of satirical columns transformed into a novel, and one collection of short stories.

2. Material and Method

This study's primary goal is to analyse the variety of code-switching strategies observed in Pakistani Anglophone literature; as such, a textual analysis method is coupled with a qualitative content analysis approach. Since textual analysis is a sort of qualitative analysis that emphasises characterising a text's content, structure, and purpose as well as its underlying ideological and cultural presuppositions, the researchers believe it best suits the goal of this research endeavour. Thus, the researchers used the textual analysis method, which is a three-step procedure that includes text selection, text coding and classification, and text analysis and interpretation. The researchers preferred just four fictional works of Pakistani Anglophone writingss published in the first decade of the twenty-first century to corroborate their observations with empirical data since, as in textual analysis, the quantity of works cannot be statistically assessed. These works include Kamila Shamsie's *Kartography* (2001), Nadeem Aslam's *Maps for Lost Lovers* (2004), Moni Mohsin's *The Diary of a Social Butterfly* (2008) and Daniyal Mueenuddin's *In Other Rooms, Other*

Wonders (2009). These authors were selected because of their significant contributions to Pakistani Anglophone literature. Ever since they began their writings careers in the 1990s, Kamila Shamsie and Nadeem Aslam have each written over five novels. While Moni Mohsin and Daniyal Mueenuddin gave Pakistani Anglophone literature a seismic shake throughout the first two decades of the twenty-first century. As of right now, the best example of Pakistani Anglophone short fiction is thought to be found in Mueenuddin's collection of short stories., while Moni Mohsin has had four of her works published. In addition, their writingss are regarded as the most emblematic of Pakistani English literature and have won several important national and international honours. Pakistani university curricula include several of their works as required readings. Whatever their current nationality, they also all have a common Pakistani identity that is evident in the way they think, perceive the world, and interact with Pakistani languages, cultures, customs, and ethos. This is evident in the manner they developed the themes, characters, and literary conventions in light of Pakistani culture. In other words, their artistic endeavours have been grounded on Pakistani soil.

2.1. Code-switching Strategies in Pakistani Anglophone Writings: An Analysis

In Pakistani Anglophone writingss, a variety of code-switching strategies are used to portray a multicultural and multilingual Pakistani society. Pakistani Anglophone writers frequently intersperse Pakistani languages in their writingss since their language symbolizes a culturally distinct society. Although English is the language of choice, they incorporate a variety of Pakistani words, phrases, expressions, and idioms in their English writingss. They do, however, use the easily accessed and transparent lexical items with Pakistani provenance, frequently accompanied with a translation into English, which offers a near approximate of the Pakistani term or expression. In addition to the easily accessible and transparent use of words of Pakistani origin, Pakistani Anglophone writers use the words and expressions of Pakistani languages with a contextually discernible meaning, albeit not in every case. These words and expressions reflect the socio-cultural, ethnolinguistic and religiopolitical society of Pakistan and belong to various lexico-semantic categories, such as clothing and accessories, concepts, kinship terms, food, religion (Islam), salutations, art forms, occupations, articles of use, fauna and flora, and names of places. However, when used in Pakistani English, these lexical items carry their generalised meaning even if they may have diverse implications and cultural significance in Pakistani languages. The use of these lexical items on the one hand challenges, defies, and refutes the hegemony of the English language in the postcolonial world, and on the other, contributes to the domestication of the English language in a Pakistani context. In addition to these, a more radical strategy of code-switching is the use of hybridised language in Pakistani Anglophone writings, which was introduced by Moni Mohsin in her works, coupled with calques, which are creative English renditions of Pakistani words, phrases, and idioms translated literally or figuratively. This is another covert strategy of code-switching that is also used frequently in Pakistani Anglophone writings. However, when writings in English, Pakistani Anglophone authors do not just replicate an exotic work by incorporating words, expressions, or even complete sentences that have Pakistani origins. Aslam (2017) puts it:

> I do not use the English language in the same way that someone born in the Britain would. The language I use has the 26 letters of the English alphabet, but they seem aware of the presence of the 38 letters of the Urdu’s alphabet too. . .. And as with language, so with place: I belong to both England and Pakistan (Aslam, personal communication, 2017, cited in Jadoon & Ahmad, 2022, p. 895)

They use Pakistani languages to allude to their own histories, experiences, demographic realities, and ways of being Pakistani. Here is a thorough analysis of the various code-switching strategies used by the selected Pakistani Anglophone writers in their works.

2.1.1 Easily Accessed and Transparent Use of Pakistani Languages

In Pakistani Anglophone writingss, words and expressions of Pakistani languages often occur with English translations for monolingual English readers. Pakistani writers most frequently use words and expressions of Pakistani origin, and provide their translation equivalents, which cover, among other things, forms of address, clothing, cuisine, thoughts, and allusions to religion. These straightforward, readily accessible terms and idioms are often italicised, represent the author's native tongue, and are not challenging for readers who just speak English as their first language. Furthermore, Pakistani writers emphasised their linguistic otherness and demonstrated their socio-cultural orientations by placing or juxtaposing their English counterparts' side by side and, where necessary, by including self-explanatory annotations. Aslam provided the English translations of the most frequently used words and expressions in *Maps for Lost Lovers* (2004), which he also italicised, such as, "*Aab-e-Ravan*, the Flowing Water" (p. 37), "*Mausam-e-Sarma, Bahar, Mausam-e-Garma, Barsat, Khizan*. Winter, Spring, Summer, Monsoon, Autumn" (p. 5), "Thank you, *Sohnia*; the Beautiful One" (p. 12), and "… naan bread shaped like ballet slippers…" (p. 32). He even used certain Urdu couplets and offered their English translations, for example:

> *Choli ke pechay kya hai, choli ke pechay?*
> *Chunri ke nechay kya hai, chunri ke nechay?*
> What are you hiding behind that blouse?
> What is being kept covered under the veil?
> *Choli me dil hai mera,*
> *Chunri me dil hai mera:*
> *Yeh dil main doon gi mere yar ko, pyar ko.*
> The blouse contains my heart,
> The veil conceals my heart:
> The heart which I'll give to my lover, to my beloved.
> (pp. 123-124)

Non-italicized use of these easily accessed and transparent words and expressions of Pakistani provenance is an orthographic extension of this strategy, and some Pakistani Anglophone writers even tend to favor the non-italicized use over the italicized one, trying to demonstrate that they do not accord any prestigious place to English alone. Aslam also used several of these terms without italics, like "Kiran —a ray of light" (p. 7), "Dasht-e-Tanhaii. The Wilderness of Solitude, The Desert of Loneliness" (p. 29), "My name is Mahtaab. The moon" (p. 55), "An Indian Hindu scholar claimed that Anarkali, Pomegranate Blossom …" (p. 82), and "Kaukab soaks some basmati rice. Bas—scent; mati—earth" (p. 298). Shamsie in *Kartography* (2001) likewise favored the use of words and expressions of Pakistani pedigree without italicising them, with a select few exceptions when she italicised Pakistani terms, such as, "*Mera Piya Ghar Aya* … My beloved came home" (p. 164). Her un-italicised use includes, "Yet Uncle Asif had … dismissed all that with one word: muhajir. Immigrant" (p. 40), "… a village woman bearing an earthenware matka full of water" (p. 60), "… ghutnay chhil gaye, yaar, yes, skin peels off knees …" (p. 69), "I have already invoked the Ghutnas, the Karachi Knees, …" (p. 69), and "We crossed Kala Pul, the Black Bridge …" (p. 164). Mueenuddin used both italicised and unitalicised Pakistani terms in *In Other Rooms, Other Wonders* (2009) in easily accessed and transparent manner, as, "… *charpoy*, a bed made of rope" (p. 7), "… he ate the food prepared in the *dera*, the administrative center" (p. 56), and "He named the child Allah Bakhsh, God-gifted one" (p. 43). Along with this, Mueenuddin (2009) also employed several terms in reverse, i.e., he first provided the English translation before providing the Urdu version. For example, "The sunset call to prayers, the *azaan*, had just finished…" (p. 216). In this example, "the sunset call to prayers" is used initially, and then the native expression "azaan" is

used to emphasise the connotations. This shows that the English words do not express the same meanings as “azaan”.

2.1.2 Untranslated Words/Lexical Fusion (Cushioned Switches)

In Pakistani Anglophone writingss, the writers’ fusion of certain lexical items from native languages in their works is another widely practiced strategy of code-switching that reflects the cultural difference and challenges the monolingual English reader. These lexical items appear in both italicised and un-italicised forms without any translation. As a result, readers of English who are monolingual may not be able to fully comprehend the text and may frequently infer meaning from context. For example, “Lily insisted that the two main ceremonies, the shadi and valima, be telescoped into one” (Mueenuddin, 2009, p. 195). And, “Suno, yaar, Karim and Raheen are almost … no, oh khuda, they are teenagers” (Shamsie, 2001, p. 9). These two examples could present a problem to the monolingual English reader since there is not enough context in the sentences to allow the reader to infer what the untranslated terms might signify. Yet given the context in which they are used, the reader can deduce their meaning.

In the majority of cases, however, the use of lexical fusion is obvious enough, and the sentences do have enough cushioning for a monolingual reader to guess what these untranslated terms could mean. Such as the following list of untranslated italicised switches among the English-language selections of Pakistani literary writingss:

- “*Mai Kolachi*, I said” (Shamsie, 2001, p. 340).
- “Save the honour of your servant, *O Parvardigar*” (Aslam, 2004, p. 36).
- “… that the *aloo bhurta* had to be *turka’d* moments before it was served” (Aslam, 2004, p. 37).
- “She sets the *mung dahl* on the cooker …” (Aslam, 2004, p. 37).
- “Come on, make us some *parathas*” (Mueenuddin, 2009, p. 8).
- “At lunch she made the *chapattis* …” (Mueenuddin, 2009, p. 31).
- “*As-salaam uleikum*, Doctor Sahib, said Nawab” (Mueenuddin, 2009, p. 14).
- “… the *maulvi* … had finished the *maghreb* call for prayers” (Mueenuddin, 2009, p. 67).
- “He wore a long formal coat, a sherwani, embroidered with gold thread” (Mueenuddin, 2009, p. 196).
- “… they would drive late at night to the bazaar and have feed from the stalls, *Haleem, dai bhalay, taka tak*” (Mueenuddin, 2009, p. 199).
- “… the male guests would sit to mourn during the *jenaza*” (Mueenuddin, 2009, p. 134).
- “Husna found a suit of clothing …, a cheap *shalvar* and *kurta*” (Mueenuddin, 2009, p. 134).
- “… buy a three-kilo box of sweets, fat yellow *ludhoos, ghulab jaman, barfi, shahi tukrah*” (Mueenuddin, 2009, p. 235).

While the following is a list of untranslated un-italicised switches in the selected Pakistani Anglophone literary works:

- “He was wearing sneakers with his shalwar-kaneez” (Shamsie, 2001, p. 173).
- “… I should at least cover my bare arms with my dupatta” (Shamsie, 2001, p. 172).
- “Jaanoo, Ali’s right” (Shamsie, 2001, p. 183).
- “Where is he? Ami said” (Shamsie, 2001, p. 192).
- “Aba rolled his eyes” (Shamsie, 2001, p. 192).
- “… I was’t harassed by lafangas …” (Shamsie, 2001, p. 246).
- “Suno, yaar, Karim and Raheen are almost … no, oh khuda, they are teenagers” (Shamsie, 2001, p. 9).
- “A spring or summer meal is nothing without … mint chutney” (Aslam, 2004, p. 163).

- "… smoking a hookah, …" (Mueenuddin, 2009, p. 23).
- "… he had dyed his hair red with henna …" (Mueenuddin, 2009, p. 24).
- "They waited for her… all three wearing saris" (Mueenuddin, 2009, p. 135).
- "She rose and positioned her shawl" (Mueenuddin, 2009, p. 153).

On the one hand, these untranslated words—whether italicised or not—in the textual structure of Pakistani Anglophone writingss present a slight challenge for the monolingual English reader, but on the other, they debunk claims about the predominance, centrality, and superiority of any particular code and capture the linguistic reality of the multilingual Pakistani society. Also, these untranslated words and expressions are frequently used in culturally specific contexts since English lacks precise lexical equivalents. Moreover, they facilitate economy of expression and transmit a variety of culturally distinct connotations.

This strategy is extended by leaving untranslated words, expressions, or even entire sentences without providing adequate cushioning. As Shamsie in *Kartography* (2001), occasionally used untranslated phrases and sentences, such as,

- "Dholikis, mehndis, mayouns, milads, sham-e-rangs, ganas, shadi receptions, valimas—among the absurdly extravagant there is a card for each occasion…" (p. 68).
- "… you know, *mujh say pehli si muhubat*, …" (p. 141).
- "Jazbaa, joush, Razzmatazz" (p. 168).
- "Allah ka shukar, Raheen Bibi, Karim Baba, Allah ka shukar" (p. 247).
- "Haalaat bohot kharab hain" (p. 318).

Yet, the majority of the untranslated Pakistani words in Pakistani Anglophone writingsss are simple enough for a monolingual speaker to understand, and they are written with the monolingual reader in mind. Therefore, code-switching is frequently predictable in style, and readers who read simply in English face little cognitive challenges.

2.1.3 Sustained Code-Switching (Radical Bilingualism)

In Pakistani Anglophone writingsss, Mohsin introduced sustained code-switching that is only legible to bilingual readers. Her work, *The Diary of a Social Butterfly* (2008), which was based on selected pieces from her witty and popular satirical column that she has contributed to the weekly Friday Times since the 1990s and later published in the form of a novel, blurred the boundaries of English, Urdu, and Punjabi. An upwardly mobile Lahore socialite named Butterfly is featured in this work, which is written in a delightfully inventive hybrid language. With its creative interweaving of English interrupted with colloquial Urdu and Punjabi, 'Butterfly' occupies a unique position in Pakistani-English journalism. In addition, this unusual blend of fiction and satirical newspaper columns is the first example in Pakistani Anglophone literature of a literary form that was developed for the local press and went on to become a worldwide success.

In *The Diary of a Social Butterfly* (2008), Mohsin primarily used English, however the text accurately depicts the wide range of linguistic alternatives available to multilingual speakers in both English and Urdu/Punjabi. These languages' monolingual speakers might find it challenging to read this text. As Butterfly says:

> As Mulloo so rightly points out, if she can do that to her best friend what will she do to her best enemas, sorry, sorry, I mean enemies? Nerves meri shatter ho gayee hain, that is why I am forgetting my English. Vaisay tau I am convent-educated. Even got first prize for reading and obedience in class one. But really, just look at Floozie. She's known Dropsy since KG, when they used to sit next to each other in Little Sweet Hearts School on Jail

> Road only. Imagine! What a sleeve ka snake she's turned out to be. Back stabber jaisi na ho tau (Mohsin, 2008, p. 9)

The text revolves around Butterfly and her Oxford-educated husband, Janoo, who belongs to Lahore's landed nobility and is a bore. Their relationship is beautifully crisp and entertainingly depicted through Mohsin's use of innovative language. Boring things like "reading-sheading" appeal to him (Mohsin, 2008, p. viii). He is concerned about politics, the tsunami, al-Qaeda, and the Taliban, while Butterfly is engrossed in name-dropping and recording the antics of friends, rivals, and acquaintances with nicknames like Floozie, Dropsy, and Mulloo, all of whom are engrossed in a dizzy whirl of weddings, balls, Halloween parties, and shopping, just as Butterfly is. She notes:

> But despite my illness, I've not missed a single party or shaddi. Because I know how much people look forward kar raha hotay hain to my coming. So first I went to Sheheyrar Ali's wedding. Bara fit scene tha, with fountains and peacocks and jewels to die for. Nice plot they have for a party, vaisay. Big-big, open-open (Mohsin, 2008, p. 128)

She made observations about politicians, such as, "But what I want to know is why Nawaz Sharif has also gone and got a rug on his head? He's not getting married again. Or is he? You never know with men, vaisay. Men can do anything anytime" (p. 112), Mullahs as "Bhai, I tau want anyone but mullahs. Even Imran or Nawaz are better, but Janoo says that they are hand-in-glove with mullahs. And because they like to pretend they are not, they are much more dangerous" (p. 172), and current events, when Butterfly says, "Mullah Omar flees Kabul. Why, asks Butterfly, did he not go to the mountains and become a 'gorilla' (p. 33)?" Butterfly largely ignores newspaper headlines and national events, but they are recorded as chapter headings alongside Butterfly's current concerns: "September 2001: al-Qaeda attacks New York and blows up Twin Towers: Butterfly loses patience with Janoo for hogging the TGV" (Mohsin, 2008, p. 24) OR "January 2003: US sends desert force to Gulf: Butterfly bemoans the lack of good new year parties" (Mohsin, 2008, p. 67). Although the text is primarily written for Pakistani readers, it paved the way for writers who want to attempt more daring linguistic experimentation. Moreover, Mohsin's code-switching is not only sustained but radical in nature as well. She switched multiple times within a single sentence, as in, "Hai Allah, I'm so excited na, so excited na, keh bus. Why? Haw, on which planet are you living? Apollo thirteen? Don't you know about Basant" (Mohsin, 2008, p. 12)? And, "Hai, sub log itnay impress huay keh there was complete silence for two minutes full" (Mohsin, 2008, p. 15). Some linguists contend that *The Diary of a Social Butterfly* (2008) captures a code-switching mode that is distinct from other languages, and that this text is an excellent illustration of sustained intrasentential code-switching—a type of code-switching that is limited to the most proficient bilingual speakers within a bilingual and bicultural community. For example, when Butterfly describes her love for winter as:

> I wish the year was full of Decembers and Januarys and Februarys. No more bore Junes, Julys and Augusts, when nothing happens. Bas, all-year parties-sharties, balls-volls, weddings-sheddings, return of all the abroad- wallahs, constant aana-jaana, new joras, afra tafri—hai, how nice that would be, na. This year tau the winters have been totally aafat (Mohsin, 2008, p. 37).

In addition to sustained code-switching, Mohsin coined a number of new words in different ways, which include (a) lexical forms that fall under morphology, (b) those that qualify as borrowings, and (c) forms that are unstable or unpredictable. She used English affixation with Urdu words (used in our Pakistani context), such as, "ghararas" (p. 30), "designer joras" (p. 151), "chappals" (p. 16), "Bhindis" (p. 30), "Karelas" (p. 16), "lootos three banks" (p. 15), and "Charroes on my nerves" (p.

36) to pluralize them. While she used Urdu affixation 'ji' with English words, as, "Gandhiji" (p. 92), and "Ji, B-b-b-egum Sahibji" (p. 101), which in Pakistani culture is considered as an honorific or an expression of respect. Furthermore, she coupled the root of a word with affixation (suffix/prefix) to create compound words, as in, "shaadi season" (p. 154), "Tabahi wedding" (p. 27), "abroad-wallahs" (p. 37), and "Electronic Tasbeeh" (p. 27). She also used "ed" to create adjectival forms, as "Mistooked" (p. 51), ('ed' with the past participle mistook), "Principaled stand" (p. 45), ('ed' with the noun principal), "Rreliefed" (p. 65), ('ed' with noun relief), and "AC'd rooms" (p. 14) ('d' with noun AC).

The Diary of a Social Butterfly (2008) is replete with unusual collocations, such as, "damn fool crack" (p. 45), in which the noun 'crack' coupled with 'damn fool' which turns it into a unique expression and serves as an intensification marker to signify annoyance, anger, and occasionally even affection. Another example is "American Born Confused Desi" (p. 50) (abbreviated ABCD by Butterfly), where the postnominal 'Desi' is used to create humour and, as a result, brings laughter to others with its 'Punjabised' touch. The collocation "three-tiara cake" (p. 185) is also odd since the word 'tiara,' which means 'aeroplane' in Urdu, is inserted in the middle of the phrase. The meaning that can be deduced from this neologism is a type of cake that has two to three layers stuffed inside of it and develops substance and eatable value in that sense. In addition to unusual collocation, she used novel noun phrases, like "little bit bonga" (p. 50), and "Twenty-what kay bulb" (p. 21) as well. The use of hyphenated phrases is also in abundance, such as, "Funny-si look" (p. 39), "Bore-sa village" (p. 7), "Baggy-si jeans" (p. 50), and "Top ki films" (p. 7). These examples include the Urdu words 'si,' 'sa,' and 'ki in the middle of phrases that otherwise only contain English words. These added Urdu words are equivalent to English terms like 'similar' or 'like,' which are used as prepositions or to indicate some similarity. Like is also used as a suffix, such as in the phrase 'childlike.' Also, the text makes heavy use of Pakistani expressions, many of which have several meanings depending on the context. For example, 'haw hi', 'Hi Allah', 'but chalo', 'Bus, enough is enough', 'Tauba tauba', and 'Writings shiting.' This innovative use diversifies the language in the Pakistani context.

She literally translated Pakistani idioms to create some amusing renditions, like "What a sleeve ka snake she's turned out to be. Back stabber jaisi na ho tau" (p. 9), "The Old Bag had arrived to blacken my face in front of everyone" (p. 101), "Can you imagine how my nose will be cut if I don't get the visa now" (p. 52)? and "Vaisay, really, Mullah Omar's also blackened our faces in front of the whole world" (p. 35). She also employed a spelling system that corresponds to the way she pronounces certain sounds, such as, "bagground" (p. 7), "sho shweet" (p. 50), "Uncle Kaukab (whom Janoo calls Uncle Cock-Up)" (p. 62), "die-vorce" (p. 65), "Messachewsits" (p. 67), "mammaries" (p. 90), and "faaabulous" (p. 80). In addition, she extensively used Urduised and Punjabised words in the text, such as shahtooshe, chaprasi, tamasha, bonga, panga, patang, fillum (film), milluk shake (milk), toash (toast), and Unteek (antique).

Mohsin's radical bilingualism ventured into many novel and pungent flavors of English coupled with Urdu and Punjabi. She developed a superb ability to switch between languages with ease, transcended the prescriptive rules of language use, and produced a text that is entirely multilingual from the start to the end. Rarely does a sentence not include both Urdu/Punjabi and English. *The Diary of a Social Butterfly* (2008) is therefore not only interesting to read because it critiques the sociopolitical ailments of our society, but it is also a valuable work for scholars who wish to study the radical bi/multilingual phenomenon in postcolonial texts.

3. Conclusion

The four works by Pakistani Anglophone authors—Kamila Shamsie's *Kartography* (2001), Nadeem Aslam's *Maps for Lost Lovers* (2004), Moni Mohsin's *The Diary of a Social Butterfly* (2008), and Daniyal Mueenuddin's *In Other Rooms, Other Wonders* (2009)—were reviewed in this study to

examine the code-switching strategies in Pakistani Anglophone writings. Easily accessed (translated), untranslated words and expressions, and persistent or extreme code switching were the main areas of interest for the researchers. The study discovered that code-switching strategies were extensively employed by Pakistani Anglophone writers to capture the multilingual realities of Pakistani society. Given that their writings provide as an illustration of a contact zone where English and Pakistani languages interact and either comfortably or uncomfortably coexist. In addition, the researchers believed that Pakistani Anglophone writers frequently used code-switching strategies to fill in the lexical gaps in Standard English on the one hand and, on the other hand, they deliberately tried to develop a Pakistani idiom in English. The incorporation of the Pakistani languages in Pakistani Anglophone texts, whether explicitly or implicitly, is only one strategy authors might have to appropriate and reconfigure English in their context. Therefore, they used a variety of code-switching strategies, which included the use of easily accessed, untranslated words and expressions and the extreme use of Pakistani languages in English texts to illustrate the fact that there is more than one way to use English and to demonstrate that the Pakistani Anglophone writings are an embodiment of Pakistani identity. This trend indicates that Pakistani languages continue to push into areas that were once exclusively English language arenas, as the number and influence of Pakistani Anglophone writers increase. It is probable that Pakistani languages will take up more and more textual space in Pakistani Anglophone writings published by mainstream publishers over the coming years as a result of radical multilingual literary texts like *The Diary of a Social Butterfly* (2008), which achieved worldwide popularity. In order to gain a more comprehensive understanding of code-switching and its role in the emergence of a Pakistani idiom in English, the researchers recommend including a larger range of texts into their investigation of the phenomenon of code-switching in Pakistani Anglophone literature.

References

Ashcroft, B., Griffiths, G., & Tiffin, H. (2001). *The Empire Writes Back: Theory and Practice in Post-Colonial Literatures*. Routledge.

Aslam, N. (2004). *Maps for Lost Lovers.* Penguin Random House India.

Baumgardner, R. J., Kennedy, A. E. H., & Shamim, F. (1993). The Urduization of English in Pakistan. In R. J. Baumgardner (Ed.), *The English Language in Pakistan* (pp. 83-203). Oxford University Press.

Grosjean, F. (1982). *Life with Two Languages: An Introduction to Bilingualism*.Harvard University Press.

Gumperz, J. J. (1982). *Discourse Strategies*. Cambridge University Press.

Jadoon. N. K., & Ahmad. M. (2022). A Study of Lexical Features of Pakistani English. *Pakistan Journal of Social Research, 4*(4), 891-901.

Mohsin, M. (2008). *The Diary of a Social Butterfly.* Penguin Random House India.

Mueenuddin, D. (2009). *In Other Rooms, Other Wonders*. New York, NY: Norton Print.

Narayan, R. K. (1988). *A Literary Alchemy: Selected Essays 1958-1988*. Penguin Books.

Shamsie, K. (2001). *Kartography.* Bloomsbury Publishing.

Sidhwa, B. (1993). New English Creative Writings: A Pakistani Writer's Perspective. In R. J. Baumgardner (Ed.), *The English Language in Pakistan* (pp. 212-220). Oxford University Press.

Pakistan Journal of Society, Education and Language (PJSEL)
Journal Homepage: https://pjsel.jehanf.com/index.php/journal
ISSN
2521-8123 (Print)
2523-1227 (Online)

Climate Justice: Empowering Marginalized Voices in Environmental Discourse

Komal Nawaz[1], Farah Deeba*[2]

Original Article

1. LLM Scholar, University of the Punjab, Lahore
2. Assistant Professor, University of Sahiwal

Keywords

Climate justice, Vulnerable communities, Marginalized groups, Inclusive approaches, International cooperation

Abstract

Climate justice, a cornerstone of environmental ethics, endeavors to ensure an equitable distribution of both responsibilities and benefits in addressing the impacts of climate change. Rooted in principles of fairness and human rights, climate justice aims to rectify the disproportionate effects of climate change on vulnerable communities and future generations. This article explores the foundational concepts of climate justice, including its intersection with environmental justice and the imperative of shared responsibility in mitigating climate-related challenges. It emphasizes the importance of centering fairness and human rights in decision-making processes and underscores the disparities in climate change impacts across different populations. Moreover, the article delves into the specific vulnerabilities faced by marginalized groups, including women, individuals with disabilities, indigenous peoples, and youth, emphasizing the need for inclusive approaches to climate action. In the context of Pakistan, a country highly vulnerable to climate change impacts, the dynamics and prospects of climate justice are critically examined. Despite formidable challenges, there are promising avenues for advancing climate justice through civil society advocacy, government initiatives, and international cooperation. By prioritizing equity and resilience-building efforts, Pakistan can strive towards a more just and sustainable future for all its citizens.

1. Introductory View

Climate justice is a pivotal concept within the discourse of environmental ethics, which focuses on ensuring a fair and just allocation of both the responsibilities and rewards associated with addressing climate change effects, rooted in principles of fairness and human rights. Climate justice seeks to rectify the disproportionate effects of climate change on vulnerable groups and future generations. In other words, Climate justice is a part of environmental justice. It's about making sure that the

problems caused by climate change are shared fairly among all stakholders, and that everyone works together to solve them (Global Witness, 2023). It involves both 'rights and duties,' meaning that companies, individuals, and governments have responsibilities to assist those who will be most impacted by climate change. (Manzo, R, 2021). Climate justice means making fairness and human rights central when we make decisions and take action about climate change. It talks about how some countries and communities have more responsibility for causing the climate crisis than others. It suggests that the countries, industries, businesses, and people who have become rich by emitting lots of greenhouse gases should help those countires and comuunities which are affected by the climate change even though they haven't caused much of the problem. (United Nations Development Programme, 2023). Even in the same country, the impacts of climate change are not uniformly felt across populations; certain individuals and communities experience its effects more acutely than others because of unfair differences based on things like race, ethnicity, gender, and how much money they have. Women are hit harder by climate change because they have fewer things to help them deal with sudden changes. People with disabilities face more risks from climate change. This includes dangers to their health, ability to get food and water, and their jobs, especially in poorer countries. Indigenous Peoples, who take care of most of the world's diverse plants and animals, are facing more dangers to their lives, jobs, and traditional knowledge. Today's children and young people didn't cause the climate crisis, but they'll face its impacts as they grow up. Since older generations made choices that put their rights in danger, we need to focus on their rights in all decisions and actions about climate change. As a matter of human right, everyone should have the ability to live with respect and freedom. However, the climate crisis is causing people to lose their lives, jobs, and culture. It is making it hard for many to find enough food and water. Climate change also affects people's health. As temperatures rise and extreme weather happens more often, the air and water get dirty, making people sick. This can lead to health problems like heat exhaustion, diseases, not having enough food, and being hurt by disasters. The effects are worse for groups of people who are already struggling and can't easily deal with climate change. From 2010 to 2023, many more people died from floods, droughts, and storms in places that are highly at risk compared to safer areas. The climate crisis can also mess up a country's education system. When it's too hot or extreme weather happens, it can damage schools system and make it hard for kids to go to school. This affects the futures of young people.

In Pakistan, the dynamics and prospects surrounding climate justice are of critical importance given the country's vulnerability to climate change impacts. The nation faces a multitude of challenges, including extreme weather events, water scarcity, melting glaciers, and agricultural disruptions, all of which disproportionately affect marginalized communities. The dynamics of climate justice in Pakistan are shaped by socio-economic disparities, inadequate infrastructure, and limited reach to resources for adaptation and resilience-building efforts. Despite these challenges, there are promising prospects for advancing climate justice in Pakistan. Civil society organizations, along with government initiatives, are increasingly advocating for policies that prioritize the rights of vulnerable populations and promote sustainable development practices. Moreover, there is growing recognition of the need for international cooperation and climate finance to support Pakistan's initiatives in confronting and adjusting to the impacts of climate change, encompassing both mitigation and adaptation strategies while ensuring equity and fairness. With concerted efforts and inclusive approaches, Pakistan has the potential to address climate justice concerns, safeguarding the rights and well-being of its citizens while building a more resilient and sustainable future.

2. Bedrock of Climate Justice

Climate justice prioritizes human rights as a core element of global development efforts. It acknowledges the challenges faced by poor communities affected by climate change, it advocates

for fair allocation of climate funds, and encourages the involvement of vulnerable groups in decisions regarding climate solutions. This concept is gaining traction in the evolving international sustainable development agenda. However, its ability to influence policies and actions depends on the establishment of a robust operational and conceptual framework (Briefing. 2013). Climate justice understands that even though some people didn't cause much pollution, they will suffer the most from climate change. Governments need a good plan for climate justice that considers ideas from political, environmental, social, and developmental justice. Environmental justice means sharing risks fairly, understanding different people's needs, and recognizing everyone's rights. Environmental justice consists of three main parts: fair sharing of environmental risks, acknowledging people's different needs and experiences, and involvement in the political decisions about environmental policies. Using these earlier ideas, climate justice acknowledges the rights and needs of poor people who are most affected by climate problems. It asks that the money for dealing with climate change is shared fairly and encourages everyone, especially women and young people, to take part in decisions. This means that climate justice makes sure human rights are the focus of worldwide development actions (Roser, & Seidel, 2016).

3. Climate Justice and Marginalised Communities

The meaningful inclusion and active engagement of women, youth, indigenous populations, and marginalized communities are indispensable factors in shaping the course of our planet's future, fostering equitable development, and nurturing sustainability for generations to come. It's crucial that they have opportunities to engage in decision-making processes and contribute to policy implementation with meaningful roles or empowerment. It is pertinent to mention here that, throughout history, young people have often been at the forefront of movements addressing environmental, social, and racial injustices. However, in recent years, their mobilization around climate justice has reached unprecedented levels. Inspired by figures like Greta Thunberg, millions of children and youth worldwide have voiced their concerns and demanded urgent action from their governments on climate change. They emphasize the pressing nature of the issue, recognizing that they will bear the brunt of its consequences more than previous generations. For children born in the 21st Century, the impacts of climate change are already evident, with increased vulnerability to climate-related disasters and everyday challenges like poor air quality and contaminated water. The repercussions extend to issues like stunted growth in millions of children globally and the potential for millions more to be pushed into extreme poverty by the time today's young climate activists reach their late 20s. Additionally, projections suggest a significant rise in malnourished children by 2050 due to the effects of climate. Considering these concerns and feeling dissatisfied with the slow progress and limited scope of previous climate negotiations, 330 youth delegates from more than 140 countries, with a significant majority from the global south, convened at MOCK COP26 in 2020. Together, they crafted a comprehensive global conference declaration focused on six primary themes, one of which was climate justice. Moreover, during the latest COP 26 summit, tens of thousands of young people and other activists flooded the streets of Glasgow, calling for urgent action and highlighting the importance of climate justice (UNICEF. 2022). In 2006, Ricardo Lagos, who was the UN's special envoy for climate change and the former president of Chile, said that adapting to climate change starts with development, but we need a big change in thinking to make sure we have enough money and help the poorest people the most. However, making big changes isn't just about getting enough money or making sure the poorest benefit the most. We have to understand how big the challenges of adapting to climate change are and create ways for the most vulnerable people to adapt where they live. These ways should share the costs and benefits of adapting more fairly. A group called the High-Level Panel said that money for dealing with climate change should be

public, something countries have to do, reliable, given as grants, and not have conditions attached to it.

4. Barriers to Realizing Climate Justice

There exist numerous hurdles that countries and communities encounter in their pursuit of climate justice.

Lack of Transparency and Inclusivity in Climate Negotiations and Strategies- The perspectives and contributions of women, youth, natives, and vulnurable groups are essential pillars in safeguarding the future well-being and sustainability of our planet. Therefore, it is crucial that they are provided with platforms enabling their participation in decision-making and policy implementation. However, these underrepresented voices may sometimes be included merely for the sake of superficial inclusivity, resulting in limited roles or lack of empowerment, a phenomenon known as 'tokenism.'

Insufficient access to education and resources concerning the environment, *climate change, and human rights*- This limitation prevents many individuals, particularly those most affected, from engaging in meaningful discussions and policy initiatives. Language barriers compound the issue, particularly for local communities and Indigenous Peoples involved in decision-making processes.

In numerous countries, environmental activists and defenders encounter grave risks for advocating environmental rights and justice. They may face imprisonment, threats, violence, enforced disappearances, or even death. Such threats create a hostile environment, discouraging defenders from asserting their rights and demanding justice.

On a global scale, less rich countries have long been urging wealthier nations for increased financial and technical support. Although there has been some progress regarding potential finance for loss and damage, many assessments reveal that rich nations have yet to fulfill the $100 billion annual climate finance commitment agreed upon in 2009, scheduled to commence in 2020. Given the inadequacy of the existing target and the escalating effects of global warming, countries are already deliberating on establishing a new annual goal that is both science-based and financially sufficient to address the mounting climate crisis [8] (Obstacles).

In addition to the obstacles mentioned earlier, here are more barriers for realizing climate justice:

Economic Inequality: Economic disparities between countries and within communities can hinder efforts to address climate justice. Poorer communities may lack the resources needed to adapt to climate change impacts or transition to sustainable practices.

Political Resistance: Political resistance or lack of political Will can impede progress in achieving climate justice. In certain instances, governmental bodies might opt for immediate economic benefits at the expense of the enduring environmental and social well-being of communities and ecosystems, thereby sacrificing long-term sustainability for short-term gains

Institutional inactivity: Bureaucratic structures and institutional disinterest within governments and organizations may slow down efforts to enforce measures, policies and initiatives intended at promoting climate justice.

Lack of Data and Information: Insufficient data and information about the effects of climate change on marganlized groups can make it difficult to design effective adaptation and mitigation strategies.

Technological Barriers: Limited access to technology, particularly in developing countries, can hinder the adoption of sustainable practices and renewable energy solutions.

Legal and Regulatory Challenges: Inadequate or outdated legal frameworks and regulations may hinder the enforcement of climate justice policies and impede progress towards sustainability.

Addressing these additional barriers demands collaborative endeavors and joint intitiatives involving States, civil society organizations, and global institutions to promote equity, inclusion, and sustainability in climate action initiatives.

5. Inititatives taken by UNDP for Realization of Climate Justice

UNDP has a rich history of collaborating with nations on matters concerning the rule of law, human rights, and access to justice, with a particular attention on climate justice. This includes supporting constitutional reforms, advocating for the right to a clean, healthy, and sustainable environment, and championing environment-related human rights. Moreover, UNDP has aided in the making and execution of environmental and enironmental laws and regulations, as well as fostering access to information, public involvement and justice in ecological dealings.

A number of States are embedding human rights considerations in their Nationally Determined Contributions (NDCs). Through the Climate Promise initiative, UNDP is working to ensure that the revision of NDCs under the Paris Agreement is a more inclusive and rights-based process. This entails providing guidance on engaging youth meaningfully and promoting gender equality in climate action plans. UNDP also endeavors to ensure the involvment of native groups in the NDC process (UNDP). UNDP supports countries in tackling climate justice issues through various initiatives. These include:

Capacity Building: UNDP helps countries strengthen their capacity to understand, address, and adapt to climate change impacts, particularly focusing on vulnerable communities.

Policy Development: UNDP assists States in making and enforcing climate policies and regulations that promote justice, equity, and inclusion, ensuring that the voices of marginalized groups are heard and considered.

Access to Finance: UNDP helps countries access climate finance and develop sustainable funding mechanisms for climate adaptation and mitigation projects, ensuring that resources are allocated fairly and reach those most in need.

Advocacy and Awareness: UNDP advocates for climate justice at global, regional, and national levels, raising awareness about the imbalanced repercussions of climate change on disadvantaged populations and promoting inclusive solutions.

Community Engagement: UNDP facilitates community engagement and participation in climate action initiatives, empowering domestic peoples, women, youth, and other vulnerable people to contribute to decision-making processes and solutions.

Through these efforts, UNDP aims to support countries in addressing climate justice issues and building resilient and sustainable futures for all.

Around the globe, numerous countries are making strides to place justice at the core of environmental and climate issues. Here are a few examples: In ***Vietnam,*** collaborative efforts between the government and the business sector are underway to implement the UN Guiding Principles on Business and Human Rights. In ***Latin America*** and the Caribbean, countries like Panama and Argentina are focusing on enhancing access to information and justice, along with public involvment in environmental policy dialogues. They are actively engaged with the Escazú Agreement, the world's first binding treaty addressing environmental human rights, which recently entered into force. UNDP's efforts in ***Lebanon*** involve bolstering the Ministry of Environment's

capacity in environmental policy development, encompassing laws, regulations, and other policy mechanisms. ***Turkey*** is conducting training programs for young lawyers on climate justice to equip them with the tools to safeguard the rights of persons and groups threatened by environmetnal change. Additionally, the training aims to encourage governments and companies to adopt more climate-friendly policies and practices.

6. Prospects for Climate Justice

The future of climate justice entails a collective effort to tackle the disproportionate effects of climate change on vulnerable groups, promote equity in climate action, and ensure the meaningful partaking of all stakeholders in decision-making processes. It involves implementing policies and initiatives that prioritize the needs of marginalized groups, promote sustainable development practices, and foster resilience to climate-related challenges. Additionally, the future of climate justice requires continued advocacy, education, and awareness-raising efforts to mobilize global action and craft a further sustainable world for current and upcoming generations.

The voices and demands of marginalized communities and groups are gaining significant traction on the global stage. Across the globe, activists are mobilizing in the streets to advocate for change, with young climate leaders leading the charge in highlighting issues of intergenerational climate justice. In a landmark move in 2022, the UN General Assembly affirmed that every individual has the inherent right to access a hygienic, vigorous, and sustainable environment, recognizing it as an essential component of basic human rights. This declaration underscores the interconnectedness between climate change, unsustainable resource management, pollution, and biodiversity loss with the gratification of all human rights. It is anticipated to galvanize action and empower individuals to hold their governments accountable for environmental stewardship.

Responding to the urgent calls from children and young people worldwide, the United Nations Committee on Rights of Child underscored children's right to a healthy environment, with a particular attention on climate change. Through an inclusive drafting process involving over 16,000 children, the committee clarified the obligations of nations and the private sector in safeguarding this right. Small Island Developing States have been pivotal in advocating for climate justice in international negotiations. In March 2023, the United Nations General Assembly passed a historic declaration urging the International Court of Justice to provide a consultative view on countries' obligations regarding climate change. Originating from a proposal by Pacific Island students, the resolution, championed by Vanuatu and backed by a coalition of 17 nations, strives to gain a comprehensive understanding of nations' international legal duties concerning the preservation of the climate system and the consequences of inflicting substantial damage upon it, particularly for small island states and future generations.

The landscape of climate litigation is also evolving rapidly, with citizens, youth, and communities increasingly resorting to legal action against governments and corporations to address climate-related harms and injustices. At United Nations Climate Change Conference or Conference of the Parties of the UNFCCC commonely known as COP27, a groundbreaking decision was made to establish new funding mechanisms, including a dedicated fund, to aid particularly vulnerable countries and communities in responding to climate-induced loss and damage. This initiative will allocate new and additional financing specifically for addressing loss and damage experienced by those most affected.

The momentum behind the movement for climate justice is poised to intensify as the effects of climate change become more pronounced, signaling a resolute dedication to forging a future that is both fair and sustainable for every individual.

7. Conclusion

In conclusion, climate justice emerges as a critical imperative within the realm of environmental ethics, aiming to ensure equitable distribution of responsibilities and benefits in confronting the impacts of climate change. Rooted in principles of fairness and human rights, climate justice endeavors to rectify the disproportionate effects of climate change on vulnerable communities and future generations. This article has delved into the foundational concepts of climate justice, elucidating its intersection with environmental justice and the necessity of prioritizing equity and human rights in decision-making processes. Moreover, it has underscored the unique vulnerabilities faced by marginalized groups, emphasizing the need for inclusive approaches to climate action. In Pakistan, a country profoundly vulnerable to climate change impacts, the dynamics and prospects of climate justice are of paramount importance. Despite formidable challenges, there are promising avenues for advancing climate justice through collaborative efforts involving civil society advocacy, government initiatives, and international cooperation. By prioritizing equity and resilience-building efforts, Pakistan can aspire towards a more just and sustainable future for all its citizens. The future of climate justice hinges upon collective endeavors to address the disproportionate effects of climate change, promote equity in climate action, and ensure the meaningful participation of all stakeholders. It involves implementing policies and initiatives that prioritize the needs of marginalized groups, foster sustainable development practices, and bolster resilience to climate-related challenges. Additionally, continued advocacy, education, and awareness-raising efforts are essential to mobilize global action and craft a more sustainable world for current and future generations. As the momentum behind the movement for climate justice intensifies, fueled by the increasing impacts of climate change, there is a resolute dedication to forging a future that is fair and sustainable for every individual. By embracing the principles of fairness, equity, and human rights, nations can pave the way for a world where climate justice is not merely an aspiration, but a tangible reality for all.

References

Global Witness. (2023, October 25). What is climate justice? Retrieved from https://www.globalwitness.org/en/campaigns/environmental-activists/what-climate-justice

Manzo, R. (2021, March 19). Climate equity or climate justice? More than a question of terminology. International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN). Archived from the original on 2023, September 28.

United Nations Development Programme. (2023, June 30). Climate change is a matter of justice – here's why. Climate Promise. https://climatepromise.undp.org/news-and-stories/climate-change-matter-justice-heres why#:~:text=Climate%20justice%20means%20putting%20equity,relation%20to%20the%20climate%20crisis (Accessed February 4, 2024)

Briefing. (2013, September). Climate justice and international development: policy and programming. Retrieved from https://www.jstor.org/stable/resrep01530 (Accessed April 2, 2024).

Roser, D., & Seidel, C. (2016). Climate justice: An introduction.

What are the obstacles to achieving climate justice? Retrieved from https://climatepromise.undp.org/news-and-stories/climate-change-matter-justice-heres-why#:~:text=Climate%20justice%20means%20putting%20equity,relation%20to%20the%20climate%20crisis. (Accessed April 2, 2024).

UNICEF. (2022, February). Climate Justice Roundtable: Recap and Reflections [Online discussion with activists and experts]. Retrieved from https://www.unicef.org/globalinsight/media/2866/file (Accessed February 3, 2024).

What are the obstacles to achieving climate justice. Retrieved from https://climatepromise.undp.org/news-and-stories/climate-change-matter-justice-heres-why#:~:text=Climate%20justice%20means%20putting%20equity,relation%20to%20the%20climate%20crisis. (Accessed February 4, 2024).

How is UNDP supporting countries to tackle climate justice issues? Retrieved from https://climatepromise.undp.org/news-and-stories/climate-change-matter-justice-heres-why#:~:text=Climate%20justice%20means%20putting%20equity,relation%20to%20the%20climate%20crisis. (Accessed February 3, 2024).