

**EFFECTIVENESS OF STEM IN TEACHING LEARNING PROCESS AT SECONDARY SCHOOL LEVEL**Muhammad Ramzan<sup>1</sup> (Corresponding Author), Dr. Najam Ul Kashif<sup>2</sup>**Original Article**

1. PhD Education Scholar, Department of Education, The Islamia University of Bahawalpur, Pakistan. Email: mohammadramzan119990@gmail.com
2. Assistant Professor, Department of Education, The Islamia University of Bahawalpur, Pakistan Email: drnajam.ulkashif@iub.edu.pk

**Abstract**

*Effectiveness of STEM education in teaching learning process of teachers and students has a great field in this technological period. Pakistan is in early stages of integrating STEM education in teaching learning process in developing countries of the world. The purpose of this research was to discuss STEM education and the factors involved in teaching learning process in general. This research was a descriptive in nature and quantitative analyses of data were used in this work. The populations of the study were all the teachers of secondary schools in three district of Southern Punjab namely Bahawalpur, Multan and Dera Ghazi Khan. Two hundred (200) secondary school teachers were randomly selected as a sample. The information was collected from secondary school teachers through a self-developed questionnaire. The researcher visited personally and given instructions to the teachers about filling of the questionnaire. SPSS tool was used to measure the frequency and percentage of analyzed data. The result of the study shows that there is a strong need for teachers to integrate the effectiveness of STEM and the classroom environment. The study found that education stakeholders should make it easier for teachers to make the most of STEM integrated training with the necessary resources and support teachers through training. The research may suggest that the Ministry of Education allocate funds to education department for the development and advancement of STEM integrated teaching learning process at secondary school level.*

**Keywords:** STEM Education, Teachers, Stakeholders, Teaching learning process and Secondary Schools

**Introduction**

STEM education is an advanced methodology to education (Bissaker, 2014; Sanders, 2012) and has a wide range of features within the global education policy and reform landscape. STEM education represents an interdisciplinary approach that combines the four disciplines of science, technology, engineering and mathematics (Chesky & Wolfmeyer, 2015). This method not only talks the objectives of policy reform such as the provision of mathematics and subject skills but also emphasizes that it is no longer enough for current citizens to understand science and mathematics; knowledge should be combined with engineering and technology

(Chesky & Wolfmeyer, 2015; Stehle & Peters-Burton, 2019; Margot & Kettler, 2019). Engineering design teaching is a project based method for integrating subjects requiring students to relate content knowledge to solve problems. STEM pedagogy is based on this. This encourages pupils to learn new concepts and enhance their thoughts (Mooney & Laubach, 2002).

STEM Education is characterized as a multidisciplinary in which severe academic principles are mixed with world learning in scenarios that build a relationship between school, public, work and the international business when pupils use science, technology, engineering and mathematics. STEM literacy and hence new economy competitiveness

(Tsupros, Kohler, & Hallinen, 2009). Although many definitions of STEM education have been proposed (Bybee, 2013), it is generally accepted that both in concept and training STEM education deals with the integration of four disciplines (science, technology, engineering and mathematics) in different ways and levels (NAE, 2014). STEM education stresses the need to integrate theoretical knowledge to practical issues as a basis for integrating STEM topics into education (Margot & Kettler, 2019). STEM education offers high quality science and technology education and appropriate information to understand scientific, technological and traditional relationships through the integration of S-T-E-M disciplines (Bybee, 2013).

It also gives crucial digital skills to students and soft capabilities such as problem solving, creative thinking and critical thinking of a nation's workforce for economic success (Wong, Dillon, & King, 2016; Barragán, Sánchez, CorujoVélez, Palacios-Rodríguez, & Román, 2020). Future citizens are increasingly needed to learn about STEM education concerns and to understand socio scientific technical linkages and how they are used to solve real challenges. Modern citizens should employ their acquired school based knowledge for the solution of development challenges including pollution from the environment, unforeseen climate occurrences, water and energy depletion and social and political conflicts. STEM education not only prepares exceptional students from the STEM, it also improves their innovative capacity an ever more crucial ability to openly embrace change and create the future responsibly. Modern citizens can achieve sustainable lifestyles through these sophisticated abilities: advocating human rights, gender impartiality and a culture that is not in contradiction with peace and violence; enhancing traditional diversity and fostering culture's influence to ecological development.

The era of science, technology, engineering and mathematics (STEM) is a topic emerging in modern education (Wang, 2012). This period was mainly aimed at increasing competence and competitiveness between schools and the curriculum. The concept has implications for diversified sectors such as workforce development and national security. However, the term is specifically used in educational policy

and curriculum solutions (Mujtaba & Reiss, 2015). With the global economy and the rapid development of science and technology, STEM education has become an important strategy and approach for cultivating scientific and technological innovation talent and education and teaching reform in various states around the world. In particular, the concept of STEM education is still emerging in Pakistan, however as for other developed countries, the concept has gained significant advantages.

Pakistan like other developing countries in the world is at an early stage in terms of the importance and integration of STEM in the teaching process in educational institutions. Undoubtedly, there are many obstacles to the integration of STEM into the teaching process in instructive institutes. A variety of factors affect the importance of STEM in institutions to be effective in the teaching process. STEM is incredibly significant to instructors and students, since it offers both students and teachers exceptional learning opportunities (Imaad, Wajid, Chaudhary, & Sarwar, 2016). STEM improves active learning and makes students feel accountable in and out of school.

The teacher can easily plan and prepare lessons, design procedures and material such as content, content delivery and make it easy to share resources with students based on their experience and knowledge (Misseyanni, Papadopoulou, Marouli, & Lytras, 2018).

In scientific education, there is a general consensus among researchers that one of the places to represent STEM in the education system and eliminate its negative image is to attract young minds interested in research in the first grades especially at secondary level (Swarat, Ortony, & Revelle, 2012). STEM is a revised traditional method to the teaching of science, technology, engineering and mathematics that merges the four subjects into one single meta-discipline (Fioriello, 2010). Sadly most of STEM's training is routine for both integration and superior alternative teaching practices (Marrero, Gunning, & Germain-Williams, 2014).

Integrated STEM training is focused on students and has shown the capacity to enhance material and encourage problematic resolution and better thinking skills (Stohlmann, Moore, & Roehrig, 2012). STEM Education is aimed at

understanding how science, technology, engineering and mathematics utilize this information to identify concerns, gain new understanding, use knowledge on connected issues and grasp STEM humanitarian research, design, analysis and differentiation. Our physical, intellectual and cultural life is shaped worldwide by the STEM fields.

STEM intends to teach science and math students not only to ensure their success in exams but also to improve the world. Ackermann (2007) said that the design application is not designed to reach a model in which it exists and is traditional but to imagine and then implement everything that is not in our reality. STEM integrates active and co-operative learning with verbal communication and problem solving and scientific knowledge and math, engineering structure and technological application in research, design, testing and applicable concepts (Reyes, 2012).

Successful STEM training coincides with good teaching applications and is for many teachers a subject of confusion (Breiner, Harkness, Johnson, & Koehler, 2012). Several educators are ready to begin STEM training. Wilson (2011) reports that it is an effective guide that enables students to become actively involved in science, mathematics and ingenuity and to broaden their knowledge about STEM jobs while teaching their lives better. The students therefore consistently deepen the fundamental STEM principles and concepts shared in science, technology, engineering and mathematics. STEM's participation was encouraged with five influences: interest and engagement (Zhao, Carini, & Kuh, 2004), expertise and support, attitudes and behaviour, professional knowledge and learning and knowledge of material (Swarat et al., 2012).

### **Aims and Research Objectives**

This research helps to increase the success of STEM education in Pakistani curricula and concepts including materials provided to students at different stages and relevant to Pakistani STEM education teachers. Thus we try to increase practical activities in such education. The study highlighted the role of the Pakistani Ministry of Education in this area and what needs to be done to expand STEM education and identified the benefits of STEM for educational outcomes in Pakistan. The

purpose of this study was to investigate a number of small scale STEM instruction cases, the prominent features of integrated STEM teaching and their variations. As we approached this work, we were aware of the different concepts of what integrated STEM teaching is or can be, while also intending to understand how integrated STEM teaching can be implemented in the context of real classrooms and teachers' integrated STEM conceptualization in practice. In contrast, we sought to base our work on empirical evidence for teachers' actual application of STEM lessons. The aim of the study is to examine the current literature on teachers' perceptions of STEM capacity development. This study seeks to recognize what is known about teachers' beliefs about the development of STEM talent. The following objectives were used to identify the effectiveness of STEM education in teaching and find out the factors affecting on STEM education.

### **Review of Literature**

STEM is a relatively new trend for emerging countries in the educational process and in the classroom. For teachers and administrators effective utilization of this area is also tough in the classroom. Olivarez (2012), which aims to investigate the impacts of science, technology, engineering and mathematics (STEM) on academic achievement. The result was higher than the STEM based academic group in the STEM based group in all outcomes, as STEM teachers used project based learning, collaborative learning and hands on learning that had a positive impact on students' achievement in math and subjects and reading.

Wang (2012) reveals that teacher perception of STEM integration and how to integrate them into STEM capacities in educational practices. As a result of the research, the integration of the STEM approach was achieved not by the number of integrated curricula in the classroom but by the use of engineering design by students to find the maximum number of scientific or mathematical knowledge solutions to problems. Carter's (2013) work was developed to reach a consensus on the features of an integrated STEM approach. A team of experts was selected based on their knowledge of the integrated STEM approach. The study

found inconsistencies between goals and outcomes in both the existing literature and the STEM oriented literature in the business training programs of private companies and institutions. This work identified the features of STEM's integrated curriculum approach.

In STEM education, the mix of socio cultural theory discussion and skills becomes a revolutionary way of learning. Developing a critical consciousness that supports the meaningful development of a connected world (Reynaga-Peña, Sandoval-Ríos, Torres-Frías, López-Suero, Lozano Garza, 2018). In addition, this learning technique is a marginalization reduction mechanism so that communities can benefit from both monetary and social benefits and thus measure well-being and quality of life by using other approaches such as a skills approach (Sherman, 2016). STEM education is not only a content based learning but also an integrated teaching approach that can help develop skills and lifelong learning skills (Pickering, Yuen, & Wang, 2016).

Educational institutions generally have a responsibility to train, prepare and educate students in a broad sense that is to provide the means necessary for the ever changing conditions of society and companies (Sierra-Gómez, 2013). The existing competencies required for the 21st century have created changes in existing education systems. However, the model of some schools is still outdated and in order to be a learning facilitator according to constructivist theories (Khan, 2017), teachers need to re-evaluate figures as a transmitter of knowledge.

STEM programmes identify challenges that have to be coordinated and employed productively to resolve issues in science, technology, engineering, and mathematics. During the STEM period, students are exposed to numerous scientific and engineering activities due to the various challenges which can be resolved. Therefore learning is practicable as well as a way for students and society to solve existing problems. This is a constructive strategy to train the next generation of STEM experts to make our society competitive (Sakar, 2016).

Continuously transformational learning and discussion and increasingly recognized the role of formal and non-formal contexts to educate

instructors on STEM issue have influenced the evolution of pedagogy in teaching subjects of STEM (Fernández-Limón, Fernández-Cárdenas, & Gómez Galindo, 2018). Undoubtedly, it is important for the future of the country that not all individuals are directed to STEM areas and those who are interested in these areas are directed to STEM areas. The training of upcoming STEM teachers and the support of teachers who see them affecting into places within STEM schools will require a systematic attitude to professional improvement (Wilson, 2013).

### Research Methodology

Considering the nature of the problem description method, it was considered appropriate for the job. The research was of a quantitative nature and used quantitative analysis of the data in this study. Qualitative approaches to research are especially beneficial to find meanings in personal experiences of instructors (Creswell & Poth, 2018; Merriam, 2015). To assess the effectiveness of STEM in effective teaching learning process at secondary school level in Southern Punjab, this study therefore adopted a quantitative research design to investigate this phenomenon and used a self-developed research tool to collect the data. Quantitative research design which is objective in nature provides a broad description of the problem. Therefore, in a situation where research was needed, what factors predicted STEM in the effective teaching process in secondary schools adopted by teachers were objective rather than concentrating partiality by exploring the 'how' and 'why' phenomenon happens, so a quantitative research study design was adopted. The populations of the study were all the teachers of secondary schools in Southern Punjab. Target populations of the study were taken from Districts of Bahawalpur, Multan and Dera Ghazi Khan. Sampling of the study was taken from the target population. Two hundred (200) teachers of secondary school were the population of the study. The researcher visited personally and given instructions to the teachers about filling of

the questionnaire. SPSS tool was used to measure the frequency and percentage of analyzed data.

### Results

Empirical evidence is needed to support each theory. Thus, there is no tool other than statistics to investigate the overall effect in a sample database. Therefore, descriptive and resulting statistics were applied using the Social Sciences Statistical Package (SPSS, v.22) to analyze the

data in line with the objectives of the study. Finally, conclusions and discussions were made taking into account the findings.

### Demographic Information of the Participants

Personal information plays an important role in the analysis of the research problem related to various socio cultural patterns. Table 1 provides the frequency distribution for the demographic description of the research sample.

**Table 1**

**Frequency Distribution of Demographic Details of the Participants**

Demographic Variables	Values
<b>Gender</b>	
Male	110 (55%)
Female	90 (45%)
<b>Teaching Experience</b>	
Less than 2 years	32 (16%)
2-5 years	76 (38%)
6-10 years	52 (26%)
Above 10 years	40 (20%)
<b>Education</b>	
B.A/B.Sc.	50 (25%)
M.A/M.Sc. and above	150 (75%)
<b>Material Status</b>	
Single	56 (28%)
Married	144 (72%)

The results in Table 1 show that 55% of teachers are male and 45% of teachers are female. Thus, there was almost equal representation of each gender in this study. In addition, four levels were addressed in the questionnaire to observe the impact of teaching experience on research variables. The results showed that 16% of the teachers belonged to the group of teaching experience for less than 2

years, and the largest part among all fields of practice, i.e. 38% of the teachers were in the group of 2-5 years of teaching experience. 26% of teachers have 6-10 years of teaching experience and 20% have 10 years or more. As for the marital status of the teachers 28% of the total teachers are single and 72% of the teachers are married.

### Questionnaire Data Analysis

Effectiveness of STEM in teaching learning process and factors affecting on STEM at secondary school level were presented in the following Table 2.

**Table 2**

**Teacher Factors Influencing on STEM in Teaching Learning Process**

Sr. No.	Statement		SA	A	UD	DA	SDA
1	Teachers with more education are more likely to use STEM educational resources more effectively in the teaching process.	<i>F</i>	44	120	0	30	6
		%	22%	60%	0.0%	15%	3%
2	Teachers who have easy access to STEM education resources are more likely to integrate into the teaching process.	<i>f</i>	62	100	10	12	16
		%	31%	50%	5%	6%	8%
3	Teachers' STEM knowledge has a greater impact on the teaching process.	<i>f</i>	70	74	10	30	16
		%	35%	37%	5%	15%	8%
4	Gender differences in teachers affect the use of STEM education in teaching.	<i>f</i>	64	34	42	46	14
		%	32%	17%	21%	23%	7%
5	The school education department should replace old teaching methods with new STEM teaching aids to improve teaching and learning.	<i>f</i>	64	106	4	16	14
		%	32%	53%	2%	8%	7%
6	Teachers' attitudes affect the successful integration of STEM education into teaching.	<i>f</i>	60	94	14	24	8
		%	30%	47%	7%	12%	4%
7	The government has a decent policy to improve the current state of STEM education in secondary schools.	<i>f</i>	70	94	10	10	16
		%	35%	47%	5%	5%	8%
8	The leadership of head teachers is closely linked to the experience of teachers in STEM education.	<i>f</i>	40	130	10	16	4
		%	20%	65%	5%	8%	2%
9	The school education department should support teachers in STEM training.	<i>f</i>	0	0	10	30	160
		%	0.0%	0.0%	5%	15%	80%
<b>Average</b>			<b>26.30%</b>	<b>41.80%</b>	<b>6.10%</b>	<b>11.90%</b>	<b>14%</b>

Data show that 82% believe that more educated teachers use STEM education more effectively in teaching learning process. Data depicts that 81% of teachers agreed that STEM education can be integrated into teaching learning process. Seventy two percent they think that STEM knowledge of secondary school teachers has a greater impact on teaching learning process. Teachers differed on whether teachers' gender differences affected the use of STEM education in teaching learning process. Eighty five percent of teachers believe that old teaching methods should be replaced with new STEM teaching aids to improve teaching and learning process. Majority of 77% teachers' attitudes affect the successful integration of STEM education into teaching. A majority of 82% teachers agreed that the government has a decent policy to improve the current state of STEM education in

secondary schools. 95% teachers are disagreed with the school education department's support for teachers in STEM education training sessions. Overall data shows that 68.1% teachers are agreed that factors influencing on STEM education in teaching learning process.

### Discussion and Conclusion

Effectiveness of STEM in all areas makes many changes in societies with 21st century skills and influences the importance and integration of STEM in teacher learning. The results of this study show that secondary school teachers are interested in the importance of STEM education and its integration into classroom environment. However, secondary school teachers face many challenges and obstacles to implement STEM education in classroom. Implementing STEM education at classroom level requires a lot of revenue from the Government. The study found that teachers had higher education and were

more interested in STEM education. They can make better use of STEM education. It is concluded that the gender difference of teachers has a great impact on the effectiveness of STEM education in teaching.

The results of the study shows that government should replace old teaching methods with new technologies and technological methods that play a favorable role in teaching of secondary school teachers for better learning of students. It is also observed that the school education department facilitates teachers receiving STEM education and supports teachers through STEM education trainings. This result is consistent with many studies in the literature (Eroglu & Bektas, 2016; Kızılay, 2016; Siew, Amir, & Chong, 2015). Yashar, Baker, Robinson-Kurpius, Krause, and Roberts (2006) stressed the importance of evaluating perceptions and preferences of teachers associated with engineering design before developing a curriculum for STEM. It was observed that STEM consciousness of school leaders is quite high. It was determined from the administrators that it would embody information, be productive, provide interest and motivation, help students 'cognitive, emotional and psychomotor skills and broaden students' horizons. A small number of them said they had no awareness and would not make any involvement. This finding is consistent with the responses given by teachers and supports the view that STEM education will further pay to students. Numerous studies supporting this discovery are available in the literature (Capraro, & Morgan, 2013; Chang, Ku, Yu, Wu, Kuo, 2015). Most administrators said that STEM was possible and that it had an impact on courses and some administrators said it was not.

### Recommendations for Further Studies

The purpose of this study was to observe STEM integration perceptions and classroom experiences of secondary school science teachers. One necessary next step would be to conduct a study that would look at students' learning when applying a STEM integration lesson in a science room. A work that touches on student learning can provide a more comprehensive picture of how STEM integration can or may not help students learn in STEM subjects. Since problem solving is one of the main focus areas in STEM integration in addition

to looking at STEM subjects, future research should examine students' problem solving skills and abilities when applying a STEM integration lesson in a science room. It is recommended that the government has an active role in the implementation of STEM education in secondary school education. The Ministry's education has an important role to play in allocating funds to the education department to promote STEM education at secondary school level. Senior teachers have the ability to see that they will play a leading role in providing STEM educational materials from school funds. Teachers must believe that all students can help from STEM training. As students originate to experience achievement in their classrooms, they will be encouraged to continue STEM activities. Finally, by hiring five secondary school teachers, this work builds a STEM integration model for secondary science teachers. However, the number of participants in this study may be a limitation. In order to test the STEM integration model of secondary school teachers, it is important to examine whether the study which has more participants can represent STEM integration concepts and classroom experiences of secondary school teachers in general. In addition, there is no information in this study on primary school teachers' perceptions and STEM integration classroom experiences.

### References

- Ackermann, E. (2007). Experience of artifacts people appropriations/objects "affordances". In E. V. Glaserefeld (Ed), *Keywords on radical constructivism* (pp.249-259). Rotterdam, NL: Sense publishers.
- Barragán-Sánchez, R., Corujo-Vélez, M. C., Palacios-Rodríguez, A., & Román-Graván, P. (2020). Teaching Digital Competence and Eco-Responsible Use of Technologies: Development and Validation of a Scale. *Sustainability*, 12(18), 7721.
- Bissaker, K. (2014). Transforming STEM education in an innovative Australian school: The role of teachers' and academics' professional partnerships. *Theory into Practice*, 53(1), 55-63.

- Breiner, J. M., Harkness, S. S., Johnson, C. C., & Koehler, C. M. (2012). What is STEM? A discussion about conceptions of STEM in education and partnerships. *School Science and Mathematics*, 112(1), 3-11.
- Bybee, R.W. (Ed.). (2013). *The Case for STEM Education: Challenges and Opportunities*. Arlington, Virginia: NSTA Press.
- Capraro, R. M., Capraro, M. M., & Morgan, J. R. (2013). STEM project-based learning. *An Integrated Science, Technology, Engineering, and Mathematics (STEM) Approach*, 2.
- Carter, V. R. (2013). Defining characteristics of an integrated STEM curriculum in K-12 education.
- Chang, S. H., Ku, A. C., Yu, L. C., Wu, T. C., & Kuo, B. C. (2015). A science, technology, engineering and mathematics course with computer-assisted remedial learning system support for vocational high school students. *Journal of Baltic Science Education*, 14(5), 641.
- Chesky, N. Z., & Wolfmeyer, M. R. (2015). *Philosophy of STEM Education* (Vol. 44). New York: Palgrave Macmillan US. doi, 10, 9781137535467.
- Ching-Chiang, L.W. & Fernández-Cárdenas, J. (2020). Analysing Dialogue in STEM Classrooms in Ecuador: A Dual Socioeconomic Context in a High School. *Journal of New Approaches in Educational Research (NAER Journal)*, 9(2), 194-215. University of Alicante. Retrieved June 29, 2021 from <https://www.learntechlib.org/p/217616/>.
- Çinar, S., Pirasa, N., Neslihan, U. Z. U. N., & Erenler, S. (2016). The effect of STEM education on pre-service science teachers' perception of interdisciplinary education. *Journal of Turkish Science Education*, 13(Special), 118-142.
- Eroglu, S., & Bektas, O. (2016). Ideas of science teachers took STEM education about STEM based activities. *Journal of Qualitative Research in Education*, 4(3), 43-67.
- Fernández-Limón, C., Fernández-Cárdenas, J. M., & Gómez Galindo, A. A. (2018). The role of non-formal contexts in teacher education for STEM: the case of hornos science and technology interactive centre. *Journal of Education for Teaching*, 44(1), 71-89.
- Fernández-Limón, C., Fernández-Cárdenas, J. M., & Gómez Galindo, A. A. (2018). The role of non-formal contexts in teacher education for STEM: the case of hornos science and technology interactive centre. *Journal of Education for Teaching*, 44(1), 71-89.
- Fioriello, P. (2010). Understanding the basics of STEM education. Retrieved January, 18, 2012.
- Franz-Odendaal, T. A., Blotnicky, K., French, F., & Joy, P. (2016). Experiences and perceptions of STEM subjects, careers, and engagement in STEM activities among middle school students in the maritime provinces. *Canadian Journal of Science, Mathematics and Technology Education*, 16(2), 153-168.
- Gomez, A., & Albrecht, B. (2013). True STEM education. *Technology and Engineering Teacher*, 73(4), 8.
- Imaad, S. M., Wajid, B., Chaudhary, I. U., & Sarwar, A. (2016, March). stem5: An initiative shaping the STEM narrative in Pakistan. In *2016 IEEE Integrated STEM Education Conference (ISEC)* (pp. 156-161). IEEE.
- Kızılay, E. (2016). Pre-service science teachers' opinions about STEM disciplines and education. *The Journal of Academic Social Science Studies*, 47, 403-417.
- Lesseig, K., Nelson, T. H., Slavitt, D., & Seidel, R. A. (2016). Supporting middle school teachers' implementation of STEM design challenges. *School Science and Mathematics*, 116(4), 177-188.
- Margot, K. C., & Kettler, T. (2019). Teachers' perception of STEM integration and education: a systematic literature

- review. *International Journal of STEM Education*, 6(1), 1-16.
- Marrero, M. E., Gunning, A. M., & Germain-Williams, T. (2014). What is STEM education?. *Global Education Review*, 1(4).
- Misseyanni, A., Papadopoulou, P., Marouli, C., & Lytras, M. D. (2018). Active learning stories in higher education: Lessons learned and good practices in STEM education. In *Active Learning Strategies in Higher Education*. Emerald Publishing Limited.
- Mooney, M. A., & Laubach, T. A. (2002). Adventure engineering: a design centered, inquiry based approach to middle grade science and mathematics education. *Journal of Engineering Education*, 91(3), 309–318. <https://doi.org/10.1002/j.2168-9830.2002.tb00708.x>.
- Moore, T. J., Johnson, C. C., Peters-Burton, E. E., & Guzey, S. S. (2015). The need for a STEM road map. *STEM road map: A framework for integrated STEM education*, 3-12.
- Mujtaba, T.; Reiss, M.J. The Millennium Development Goals Agenda: Constraints of Culture, Economy, and Empowerment in Influencing the Social Mobility of Pakistani Girls on Mathematics and Science Related Higher Education Courses in Universities in Pakistan. *Canadian Journal of Science, Mathematics and Technology Education*. 2015, 15, 51-68, DOI: 10.1080/14926156.2014.992556.
- NAE (National Academy of Engineering) and NRC (National Research Council). (2014). *STEM Integration in K-12 Education: Status, Prospects, and an Agenda for Research*. The National Academies Press: Washington, DC, USA.
- Olivarez, N. (2012). *The Impact of a STEM program on academic achievement of eighth grade students in a south texas middle school* (Doctoral dissertation, Texas A&M University-Corpus Christi).
- Pickering, T. A., Yuen, T. T., & Wang, T. (2016, December). STEM conversations in social media: Implications on STEM education. In *2016 IEEE International Conference on Teaching, Assessment, and Learning for Engineering (TALE)* (pp. 296-302). IEEE.
- Reyes, M. E. (2012). Increasing diversity in STEM by attracting community college women of color. *Apply Research to Practice (ARP) Resources*. Retrieved April, 5, 2012.
- Reynaga-Peña, C. G., Sandoval-Ríos, M., Torres-Frías, J., López-Suero, C., Lozano Garza, A., Dessens Félix, M., & Ibanez, J. G. (2018). Creating a dialogic environment for transformative science teaching practices: towards an inclusive education for science. *Journal of Education for Teaching*, 44(1), 44-57.
- Sakar, L. (2016). *Harmony STEM Program*. C. Fernández, Interviewer, January 29.
- Sanders, M. E. (2012). Integrative STEM education as “best practice”. Griffith Institute for Educational Research, Queensland, Australia.
- Siew, N. M., Amir, N., & Chong, C. L. (2015). The perceptions of pre-service and in-service teachers regarding a project-based STEM approach to teaching science. *Springer Plus*, 4(1), 1-20.
- Stehle, S. M., & Peters-Burton, E. E. (2019). Developing student 21 st Century skills in selected exemplary inclusive STEM high schools. *International journal of STEM education*, 6(1), 1-15.
- Stohlmann, M., Moore, T. J., & Roehrig, G. H. (2012). Considerations for teaching integrated STEM education. *Journal of Pre-College Engineering Education Research (J-PEER)*, 2(1), 4.
- Swarat, S., Ortony, A., & Revelle, W. (2012). Activity matters: Understanding student interest in school science. *Journal of research in science teaching*, 49(4), 515-537.
- Tsupros, N., Kohler, R., Hallinen, J. (2009). STEM Education: A Project to Identify the Missing Components. Intermediate

- Unit 1; *Center for STEM Education and Leonard Gelfand Center for Service Learning and Outreach*, Carnegie Mellon University: Pittsburgh, PA, USA.
- Wang, H. H. (2012). *A new era of science education: science teachers' perceptions and classroom practices of science, technology, engineering and mathematics (STEM) integration* (Doctoral Dissertation). The University of Minnesota.
- Wong, V., Dillon, J., & King, H. (2016). STEM in England: meanings and motivations in the policy arena. *International Journal of Science Education*, 38(15), 2346-2366.
- Yaşar, Ş., Baker, D., Robinson-Kurpius, S., Krause, S., & Roberts, C. (2006). Development of a survey to assess K-12 teachers' perceptions of engineers and familiarity with teaching design, engineering, and technology. *Journal of Engineering education*, 95(3), 205-216.
- Zhao, C. M., Carini, R. M., & Kuh, G. D. (2005). Searching for the peach blossom Shangri-La: Student engagement of men and women SMET majors. *The Review of Higher Education*, 28(4), 503-525.